

COMPLEXITY OF INTERACTION
ALONG THE EURASIAN STEPPE ZONE
IN THE FIRST MILLENNIUM CE

Bonn Contributions to Asian Archaeology

Volume 7

Edited by
Jan Bemann

COMPLEXITY OF INTERACTION
ALONG THE EURASIAN STEPPE ZONE
IN THE FIRST MILLENNIUM CE

Edited by
Jan Bemann, Michael Schmauder

2015
Vor- und Frühgeschichtliche Archäologie
Rheinische Friedrich-Wilhelms-Universität Bonn

708 pages, 176 figures, 12 tables

The conference and the publication were generously financed by
Gerda Henkel Stiftung
Landschaftsverband Rheinland mit LVR-Landesmuseum Bonn

The conference was co-organized and the book is co-edited by
Ursula Brosseder, Susanne Reichert, and Timo Stickler

Ein Titelsatz ist bei der Deutschen Bibliothek erhältlich
(<http://www.ddb.de>)

Desktop Publishing and Design: Matthias Weis
Translations: Authors, Daniel C. Waugh
English language editors: Alicia Ventresca Miller, Susanne Reichert
Image editing: Gisela Höhn, Matthias Weis
Final editing: Ute Arents, Güde Bemmann
Printing and binding:
DDD DigitalDruck Deutschland GmbH & Co. KG – Aalen
Printed in Germany

Cover illustration: Martin Pütz

ISBN 978-3-936490-14-7
Copyright 2015 by vfgarch.press uni-bonn

CONTENTS

PREFACE	7
---------------	---

NOMADIC EMPIRES – MODES OF ANALYSIS

NIKOLAI N. KRADIN Nomadic Empires in Inner Asia	11
NICOLA DI COSMO China-Steppe Relations in Historical Perspective.....	49
J. DANIEL ROGERS Empire Dynamics and Inner Asia.....	73
CLAUDIO CIOFFI-REVILLA, WILLIAM HONEYCHURCH, J. DANIEL ROGERS MASON Hierarchies: A Long-range Agent Model of Power, Conflict, and Environment in Inner Asia	89
PAVEL E. TARASOV, MAYKE WAGNER Environmental Aspects of Chinese Antiquity: Problems of Interpretation and Chronological Correlation	115

XIONGNU, THE HAN EMPIRE, AND THE ORIENTAL KOINE

BRYAN K. MILLER The Southern Xiongnu in Northern China: Navigating and Negotiating the Middle Ground	127
URSULA B. BROSEDER A Study on the Complexity and Dynamics of Interaction and Exchange in Late Iron Age Eurasia	199
MAREK JAN OLBRYCHT Arsacid Iran and the Nomads of Central Asia – Ways of Cultural Transfer	333

INNER AND CENTRAL ASIA FROM THE TÜRKES TO THE MONGOLS

SERGEY A. VASYUTIN The Model of the Political Transformation of the Da Liao as an Alternative to the Evolution of the Structures of Authority in the Early Medieval Pastoral Empires of Mongolia.....	391
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

MICHAEL R. DROMPP	
Strategies of Cohesion and Control in the Türk and Uyghur Empires.	437
ÉTIENNE DE LA VAISSIÈRE	
Away from the Ötüken: A Geopolitical Approach to the seventh Century Eastern Türks	453
SÖREN STARK	
Luxurious Necessities: Some Observations on Foreign Commodities and Nomadic Polities in Central Asia in the sixth to ninth Centuries	463
PETER B. GOLDEN	
The Turkic World in Maḥmūd al-Kâshgharî	503
THOMAS O. HÖLLMANN	
On the Road again – Diplomacy and Trade from a Chinese Perspective	557
MICHAL BIRAN	
The Qarakhanids’ Eastern Exchange: Preliminary Notes on the Silk Roads in the eleventh and twelfth Centuries.	575
JÜRGEN PAUL	
Forces and Resources. Remarks on the Failing Regional State of Sultānšāh b. Il Arslan Ḥwārazmšāh.	597
TATIANA SKRYNNIKOVA	
Old-Turkish Roots of Chinggis Khan’s “Golden Clan”. Continuity of Genesis. Typology of Power	623
 NOMADIC INTERACTION WITH THE ROMAN AND BYZANTINE WEST	
MISCHA MEIER	
Dealing with Non-State Societies: The failed Assassination Attempt against Attila (449 CE) and Eastern Roman Hunnic Policy	635
TIMO STICKLER	
The Gupta Empire in the Face of the Hunnic Threat. Parallels to the Late Roman Empire?	659
MICHAEL SCHMAUDER	
Huns, Avars, Hungarians – Reflections on the Interaction between Steppe Empires in Southeast Europe and the Late Roman to Early Byzantine Empires	671
WALTER POHL	
Huns, Avars, Hungarians – Comparative Perspectives based on Written Evidence	693
INDEX OF AUTHORS.	703

PREFACE

This volume combines contributions to a conference of the same title which was held February 9 to 11, 2012, in Bonn. Idea and format of the meeting had been developed through a process of intensive discussions among the editors in close cooperation with Dieter Quast, RGZM Mainz. Our original intention was to organize a conference with a focus on archaeology, bearing in mind questions concerning mobility and communication or – stated differently – exchange patterns in Eurasia. After having recognized that research in Eurasia is still dominated by site centric approaches which makes vast overviews as we imagined them somewhat cumbersome we deviated from our first outline.

As a consequence, we broadened the field for two further aspects which had been nearly neglected thus far. First, there are West–East ranging communications in the Eurasian steppe zone which lie beyond the overarching term “Silk Roads”. As written sources rarely throw light on interactions among steppe polities, these interactions are markedly less frequently subject to scientific discussions. This question is best approached via archaeological analyses with a wide focus in geographical terms. North–South contacts are by far more commonly discussed than West–East communications, as they encompass interactions between states with foremost sedentary population and nomads who live north of these territories. As a rule, it is the sedentary viewpoint which is being told, as these cultures opposed to the nomads left numerous written accounts¹. At the same time we wanted to encourage comparative perspectives. Characteristics often assumed to be typical of the relations between sedentary people and nomads are also true in comparable measures of those between Rome/Byzantium and their “barbaric” neighbors. What they all have in common is at least a distinct mobility in space, even though to varying forms and degrees. Furthermore, questions and themes long discussed in European archaeology and history entered the research of Inner Asia and Central Asia only recently, as, for example, identity, the emergence of new ethnic groups, frontiers, frontier societies, contact zones, elites, economies of prestige goods. We therefore wanted to invite colleagues of different disciplines and regions to join in a scientific dispute. Lively discussions during the conference and positive feedback by attendees show that this idea was appreciated.

The second aspect to be included can be summarized under the term “complexity”, which in this context should not be understood as a concept from the social sciences but metaphorically. Over long periods of time simple explanations of cultural phenomena were favored, be it statements on pure and poor nomads, the dependency theory or the bad habit of explaining every cultural change with large-scale migrations. “Complexity” is meant as a signal and reminder that the simplest explanations are not always the best, which is reflected by the contributions in this volume.

¹ Numerous projects within the framework of the Collaborative Research Center (Sonderforschungsbereich) 586 “Difference and Integration” at the University Leipzig and the Martin-Luther University Halle-Wittenberg dealt intensively with interactions between

nomads and settled people, a good overview of publications thus far is given by the center’s website <http://nomadsed.de/home/>.

We consciously limited the temporal scope of the papers to the time after the Scyths and before the Mongols, somewhat clumsily described as the “first millennium CE”, because these two eras have been traditionally paid enormous attention to and are represented in a corresponding flood of publications². At the same time interactions in the steppe zone witnessed only during the centuries around the turn of the era a hitherto unknown rise in intensity and dynamics.

Not all of the works presented at the conference are included in this volume as they were already noted for publications elsewhere. This applies to the presentations given by Enno Giele, Valentina Mordvintseva, and Matthias Pfisterer. However, other colleagues who could not attend the conference were invited to hand in manuscripts. All contributions were revised and partly expanded, which to our delight resulted in this comprehensive volume. We would have loved to have included a paper on the consequences of climate change and meteorological events on the politics of the Eurasian steppe as such conditions win more and more popularity as *explanans* of significant changes³, but it did not work out. To our dismay and because of different reasons the western steppes and Central Asia are less represented than we wished for.

We subdivided the contributions into four parts: “Nomadic Empires – Modes of Analysis” encompasses highly different approaches to interpretations and analyses of nomadic empires, ranging from computational agent-based models, over anthropological to historical methodology. Better than any perfect introduction this multi-faceted research shows how exciting it is to deal with this area much neglected in World History. Although the section “Xiongnu, the Han Empire and the Oriental Koine” assembles merely three contributions, it covers more than 260 pages. If nothing else, this certainly echoes the boom of Xiongnu archaeology of the past decades. By taking into account enormous amounts of archaeological, art historical, and written sources the authors surmount traditional and often too static schemes of interpretation. These new analyses detect an astonishing variety of interactions during the centuries around the turn of the era, which broadens our understanding of this epoch and provides new avenues for other regions and periods at the same time. In the third section, “Inner and Central Asia from the Türks to the Mongols”, nine contributions exemplify a multicolored and almost continuously changing picture of languages, ethnicities, and political affinities for Inner and Central Asia from the sixth to the twelfth centuries. Political affinities, however, were changing so quickly due to situational demands as to almost refute all efforts to retrace them within the archaeological record. Decision makers were astonishingly well informed about even distant regions and they acted accordingly over vast distances. The studies at hand analyze exchange processes on varying

² See for the Scyths for example W. Menghin/H. Parzinger/A. Nagler/M. Nawroth (eds.), *Im Zeichen des goldenen Greifen. Königsgräber der Skythen. Begleitband zur gleichnamigen Ausstellung*: Berlin, Martin-Gropius-Bau, 6. Juli – 1. Oktober 2007; München, Kunsthalle der Hypo-Kulturstiftung, 26. Oktober 2007 – 20. Januar 2008; Hamburg, Museum für Kunst und Gewerbe Hamburg, 15. Februar – 25. Mai 2008 (München, Berlin 2007); H. Parzinger, *Die Skythen*. 3rd ed. (München 2009); J. Aruz (ed.), *The Golden Deer of Eurasia: Scythian and Sarmatian Treasures from the Russian Steppes* (New York, New Haven 2000); J. Aruz/A. Farkas/A. Alekseev/E. Korolkova (eds.), *The Golden Deer of Eurasia. Perspectives on the Steppe Nomads of the Ancient World*. The Metropolitan Museum of Art Symposia (New Haven 2006). See

for the Mongol period *Dschingis Khan und seine Erben. Das Weltreich der Mongolen* (2005); W. W. Fitzhugh/M. Rossabi/W. Honeychurch (eds.), *Genghis Khan and the Mongol Empire* (Seattle 2009); see also the website of the European Research Council Grant “Mobility, Empire and Cross Cultural Contacts in Mongol Eurasia” <http://mongol.huji.ac.il/>, which provides an extensive bibliography.

³ N. Pederson/A. Hessel/N. Baatarbileg/K. Anchukaitis/N. Di Cosmo, *Pluvials, Droughts, the Mongol Empire, and Modern Mongolia*. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 111, 2014, 4375–4379; J. Fei/J. Zhou/Y. Hou, *Circa A.D. 626 Volcanic Eruption, Climatic Cooling, and the Collapse of the Eastern Turkic Empire*. *Climatic Change* 81, 2007, 469–475.

levels – from language to embassies – as well as aspects of mobility, from the integration of foreign symbols of power to large-scale migrations, or methods of state-building to the strategic destruction of complex states. The last section combines papers that focus on “Nomadic Interaction with the Roman and Byzantine West” traversing the Eurasian steppe zone from east to west. These case studies, either already comparative or suitable for further comparisons, give reason to assume that although there are certain encompassing communalities every conquest and struggle with the empires of the West is historically unique. At the same time it becomes apparent that the knowledge base of the decision makers in the Roman Empire had been greater than hitherto thought.

The variety of studies assembled in this volume leaves no doubt as to how dynamically and diversely the interactions, processes, and transformations developed in the Eurasian steppe zone. These changes cannot be studied under common schemes of interpretation which are more often than not inseparable from overcome clichés.

Chinese names and terms have been transliterated according to the Pinyin system, Russian names and references according to the system of the Library of Congress. Arabic, Persian, and Turkic names and terms appear in the form chosen by the authors of the individual chapters.

Acknowledgements

The conference had been jointly prepared and organized together with Ursula Brosseder and Timo Stickler. We thank both of them for their cordial and companionable collaboration. Susanne Reichert engaged to such an extent in the editing work of the papers that it was a delight for us to include her as co-editor. The edition of this volume in addition to ongoing obligations and projects could only be managed as a team.

Our heartfelt thanks also goes to Daniel Waugh, Seattle, who has helped us now repeatedly with translations and language editing. Without his honorary efforts we would never have been able to integrate Sergey Vasyutin’s thoughts in this book. Thanks to his enormous overview and language knowledge Peter Golden saved us from mistakes concerning the correct transliteration of names in the contributions of Tatiana Skrynnikova and Sergey Vasyutin. Image editing lay in Gisela Höhn’s sterling hands. She also promoted to create – as far as possible – a unified map basis for all contributions as to facilitate visualizing the different regions. Editing work was done by the proven team Ute Arents and Güde Bemann, substantially supported by Susanne Reichert. We owe Alicia Ventresca Miller, Kiel, as a native speaker many suggestions for improvement and stimuli. All authors and editors highly appreciate their painstaking efforts. For desktop publishing, which in the face of a multitude of different scripts demands unconventional solutions, we were able to win Matthias Weis. If not stated otherwise, images were provided by the authors and merely serve to illustrate.

The conference was made possible by the generous financial support from the Gerda Henkel Foundation. As always, it was our delight to collaborate with the foundation, a cooperation characterized by mutual trust. The meeting took place in the LVR-LandesMuseum Bonn, which during the same time displayed the exhibition “Steppe Warriors – Nomads on Horseback of Mongolia from the 7th to 14th centuries” (“Steppenkrieger – Reiternomaden des 7.–14. Jahrhunderts aus der Mongolei”). Thus the participants had the opportunity to get insight into an on-

going cooperation between the Institute of Archaeology of the Mongolian Academy of Sciences, the Department of Prehistory and Early Historical Archaeology of the University of Bonn, and the LVR-LandesMuseum Bonn. We thank the State Association of the Rhineland (Landschaftverband Rheinland) for the use of rooms and technical equipment of the museum and the financial support in printing this volume.

Our sincere thanks is owed to everyone who contributed to the success of the conference and the resulting book. With great joy we remember the inspiring and cordial atmosphere during the meeting.

Jan Bemann, Michael Schmauder

March 2015

INDEX OF AUTHORS

Prof. Dr. Jan Bemann
Prehistory and Early Historical Archaeology
University of Bonn
Regina-Pacis-Weg 7
53113 Bonn, Germany
E-Mail: jan.bemann@uni-bonn.de

Prof. Dr. Michal Biran
Institute of Asian and African Studies
The Louis Frieberg Center for East Asian
Studies
The Hebrew University of Jerusalem
Mt. Scopus
Jerusalem, 91905, Israel
E-Mail: biranm@mail.huji.ac.il

Dr. Ursula B. Brosseder
Prehistory and Early Historical Archaeology
University of Bonn
Regina-Pacis-Weg 7
53113 Bonn, Germany
E-Mail: ursula.brosseder@uni-bonn.de

Prof. Dr. Claudio Cioffi-Revilla
Krasnow Institute for Advanced Study
Computational Social Science, Center for
Social Complexity
George Mason University
Research-1 Bldg MS 6B2,
4400 University Drive
Fairfax, VA 22030, USA
E-Mail: ccioffi@gmu.edu

Prof. Dr. Nicola Di Cosmo
Henry Luce Foundation Professor of
East Asian Studies
School of Historical Studies
Institute for Advanced Study
Einstein Drive
Princeton, NJ 08540, USA
E-Mail: ndc@ias.edu

Prof. Dr. Michael R. Drompp
Department of History
Rhodes College
2000 North Parkway
Memphis, TN 38112, USA
E-Mail: drompp@rhodes.edu

Prof. Dr. Peter B. Golden
Center for Middle Eastern Studies
Rutgers University
Lucy Stone Hall B-316
54 Joyce Kilmer Avenue
Piscataway, NJ 08854, USA
E-Mail: pgolden@andromeda.rutgers.edu

Prof. Dr. Thomas O. Höllmann
Institute for Chinese Studies
Ludwig-Maximilians-University Munich
Kaulbachstr. 51a
80539 München, Germany
E-Mail: thomas.hoellmann@lrz.uni-
muenchen.de

Ass. Prof. Dr. William Honeychurch
 Department of Anthropology
 Yale University
 51 Hillhouse Avenue
 New Haven, CN 06511, USA
 E-Mail: william.honeychurch@yale.edu

Prof. Dr. Nikolai N. Kradin
 Russian Academy of Sciences,
 Far Eastern Branch
 Institute of History, Archaeology and
 Ethnography
 Pushkinskaia Ul. 10
 Vladivostok, 690950, Russia
 E-Mail: kradin@mail.ru

Prof. Dr. Étienne de la Vaissière
 École des hautes études en sciences sociales
 (EHESS)
 Centre d'Études Turques, Ottomanes, Balka-
 niques et Centrasiatiques (CETOBaC)
 190-198, Avenue de France
 75244 Paris Cedex 13, France
 E-Mail: vaissier@ens.fr

Prof. Dr. Mischa Meier
 Department of History
 University of Tübingen
 Wilhelmstr. 36
 72074 Tübingen, Germany
 E-Mail: mischa.meier@uni-tuebingen.de

Dr. Bryan K. Miller
 Faculty of History
 University of Oxford
 George Street
 Oxford OX1 2RL, United Kingdom
 E-Mail: millerbryank@gmail.com

Prof. Dr. Marek Jan Olbrycht
 Institute of History
 University of Rzeszów
 Ul. Rejtana 16c
 35-959 Rzeszów, Poland
 E-Mail: marekolbrycht@wp.pl

Prof. Dr. Jürgen Paul
 Institute for Oriental Studies
 Martin-Luther-University Halle-Wittenberg
 Mühlweg 15
 06114 Halle/Saale, Germany
 E-Mail: juergen.paul@orientphil.uni-halle.de

Prof. Dr. Walter Pohl
 Institute for Medieval Research
 Austrian Academy of Sciences
 Wohllebengasse 12-14
 1040 Wien, Austria
 E-Mail: walter.pohl@oeaw.ac.at

Dr. J. Daniel Rogers
 Smithsonian Institution
 National Museum of Natural History
 Department of Anthropology, NHB 112
 PO Box 37012
 Washington, DC 20013, USA
 E-Mail: rogersd@si.edu

Prof. Dr. Michael Schmauder
 LVR-LandesMuseum Bonn
 Colmantstr. 14-16
 53115 Bonn, Germany
 E-Mail: michael.schmauder@lvr.de

Prof. Dr. Tatiana Skrynnikova
 The Department of Central Asian and South
 Asian Studies
 Institute of Oriental Manuscripts
 Russian Academy of Sciences
 Dvortsovaya Emb. 18
 Sankt-Petersburg 191186, Russia
 E-Mail: skryta999@mail.ru

Ass. Prof. Dr. Sören Stark
 Institute for the Study of the Ancient World
 New York University
 15 East 84th St.
 New York City, NY 10028, USA
 E-Mail: soeren.stark@nyu.edu

Prof. Dr. Timo Stickler
Department of Ancient Studies
Friedrich Schiller University Jena
Fürstengraben 1
07743 Jena, Germany
E-Mail: timo.stickler@uni-jena.de

Prof. Dr. Pavel E. Tarasov
Institute of Geological Sciences, Palaeontology
Freie Universität Berlin
Malteserstr. 74-100, Haus D
12249 Berlin, Germany
E-Mail: ptarasov@zedat.fu-berlin.de

Dr. Sergey Aleksandrovich Vasyutin
Department of the History of Civilizations
and Socio-Cultural Communications
Kemerovo State University
Krasnya 6
650043 Kemerovo, Russia
E-Mail: vasutin2012@list.ru

Prof. Dr. Mayke Wagner
Branch office of the Eurasia Department in
Beijing
German Archaeological Institute
Im Dol 2-6, Haus II
14195 Berlin, Germany
E-Mail: mwa@zedat.fu-berlin.de;
mw@eurasien.dainst.de

BONN CONTRIBUTIONS TO ASIAN ARCHAEOLOGY

Edited by Jan Bemann

1. H. Roth/U. Erdenebat/E. Nagel/E. Pohl (eds.),
Qara Qorum City (Mongolei) 1.
Bonn Contributions to Asian Archaeology, Volume 1 (Bonn 2002).
Out of print – ISBN 3-936490-01-5
2. J. Bemann/U. Erdenebat/E. Pohl (eds.),
Mongolian-German Karakorum-Expedition, Volume 1.
Excavations in the Craftsmen-Quarter at the Main Road.
Forschungen zur Archäologie Außereuropäischer Kulturen 8 =
Bonn Contributions to Asian Archaeology, Volume 2 (Wiesbaden 2009).
€ 98,00 – ISBN 978-3-89500-697-5
3. P. B. Konovalov,
The Burial Vault of a Xiongnu Prince at Sudzha (Il'movaia pad', Transbaikalia).
Bonn Contributions to Asian Archaeology, Volume 3 (Bonn 2008).
€ 13,90 – ISBN 3-936490-29-5
4. J. Bemann/H. Parzinger/E. Pohl/D. Tseveendorzh (eds.),
Current Archaeological Research in Mongolia. Papers from the First International
Conference on "Archaeological Research in Mongolia", held in Ulaanbaatar,
August 19th–23rd, 2007.
Bonn Contributions to Asian Archaeology, Volume 4 (Bonn 2009).
€ 74,00 – ISBN 978-3-936490-31-2
5. Ursula Brosseder/Bryan K. Miller (eds.),
Xiongnu Archaeology. Multidisciplinary Perspectives of the
First Steppe Empire in Inner Asia.
Bonn Contributions to Asian Archaeology, Volume 5 (Bonn 2011).
€ 80,00 – ISBN 978-3-936490-14-7
6. Catrin Kost,
The practice of imagery in the northern Chinese steppe (5th – 1st centuries BCE).
Bonn Contributions to Asian Archaeology, Volume 6 (Bonn 2014).
€ 98,00 – ISBN 978-3-936490-32-9

7. J. Bemann/M. Schmauder (eds.),
Complexity of Interaction along the Eurasian Steppe Zone in the first Millennium CE
Bonn Contributions to Asian Archaeology, Volume 7 (Bonn 2015).
€ 111,00 – ISBN 978-3-936490-14-7

Orders and information: sekretariat.vfgarch@uni-bonn.de (1, 3–7), info@reichert-verlag.de (2)